

1 Jennifer Pafiti (SBN 282790)
2 **POMERANTZ LLP**
3 1100 Glendon Avenue
4 Los Angeles, CA 90024
5 Phone: 310-405-7190
6 Email: jpafiti@pomlaw.com

7 (additional counsel on signature page)

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

9
10 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
11 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
12 **SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

13 **Case No. 3:16-cv-04300-JD**

14 **CLASS ACTION**

15 **IN RE POKÉMON GO**
16 **NUISANCE LITIGATION**

17 **PLAINTIFFS' REPLY IN FURTHER**
18 **SUPPORT OF MOTIONS FOR FINAL**
19 **APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT AND FOR**
20 **AWARD OF ATTORNEYS' FEES AND**
21 **EXPENSES AND SERVICE AWARDS**

22 Date: August 22, 2019
23 Time: 10:00 a.m.
24 Courtroom: 11, 19th Floor
25 Judge: Hon. James Donato

Introduction

1
2 Plaintiffs Scott Dodich and Jayme Gotts-Dodich; The Villas of Positano Condominium
3 Association, Inc., on behalf of its members (“Villas”); Jill M. Barbarise; Jason Sarkis; Melissa
4 Perez; Congshan “Sam” Hao; Bruce Garton; Sally Rogers; Deborah J. Pimentel; and Loren
5 Morgan (collectively “Plaintiffs”), on behalf of themselves and the Settlement Class,
6 respectfully submit this reply in further support of their motions for (1) Final Approval of the
7 Settlement (ECF No. 135) and (2) Award of Attorneys’ Fees And Expenses and Service
8 Awards (ECF No. 136).

9 Pursuant to the Court’s May 2, 2019 Order (ECF No. 131) (the “Preliminary Approval
10 Order”), on May 16, 2019, the Long-Form Notice, Short-Form Notice, Complaint, Settlement
11 Agreement, and Preliminary Approval Order were all posted on
12 <https://www.pokemongopropertysettlement.com> (the “Class Settlement Website”), along with
13 contact information for Plaintiffs’ Counsel, the deadline to file objections, and the date of the
14 Final Approval Hearing.

15 The Short-Form Notice (which briefly summarized the Action and Settlement and
16 directed potential class members to the Class Settlement Website for further information) was
17 posted on the Pokémon GO support website on May 16, 2019; posted in the National
18 Recreation and Park Association eNewsletter on May 20, 2019; published in the *New York*
19 *Times*, *USA Today*, and *People* Magazine on May 29, 2019; and published in the Parks and
20 Rec Business eNewsletter on May 31, 2019.

21 The Long-Form Notice included all the information required by Rule 23(c)(2)(B) or
22 otherwise necessary for Settlement Class Members to make an informed decision regarding the
23 proposed Settlement, including: (i) an explanation of the nature of the Action and the claims
24 asserted; (ii) the definition of the Settlement Class; (iii) the terms of the Settlement, including
25 the means for Class members who have already gone through Niantic’s customer service
26 process to contact Plaintiffs’ Counsel for further review of their complaints; (iv) the parties’
27 reasons for proposing the Settlement; (v) that Plaintiffs’ Counsel would apply for an award of
28 attorneys’ fees and expenses not to exceed \$4 million, and compensatory awards of up to

1 \$2,500 each for the Named Plaintiffs; (vi) how to object to the Settlement; (vii) how to contact
2 Plaintiffs' Counsel with any questions; (viii) all relevant dates and deadlines; and (ix) the
3 binding effect of a judgment on Settlement Class members. It thus described "the terms of the
4 settlement in sufficient detail to alert those with adverse viewpoints to investigate and to come
5 forward and be heard." *In re Online DVD-Rental Antitrust Litig.*, 779 F.3d 934, 946 (9th Cir.
6 2015) (quoting *Lane v. Facebook, Inc.*, 696 F.3d 811, 826 (9th Cir. 2012)).

7 Plaintiffs believe that this Notice Program, especially in conjunction with the
8 considerable media coverage of this Action and Settlement, was sufficient to reach a
9 substantial portion of the Settlement Class. The periodicals and publications described above
10 are targeted towards the Class demographics (*i.e.*, private property owners), and have an
11 aggregate circulation of several million. In addition, Plaintiffs' Motion for Final Approval and
12 Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees and Expenses (ECF Nos. 135, 136) were posted on the
13 Class Settlement Website on June 17, 2019, shortly after they were filed on June 13, 2019.
14 This gave Settlement Class Members the opportunity "thoroughly to examine counsel's fee
15 motion" before the July 18, 2019 objection deadline, as required by *In re Mercury Interactive*
16 *Corp. Securities Litigation*, 618 F.3d 988, 994 (9th Cir. 2010).

17 As set forth in the Preliminary Approval Order and as specified on the Class Settlement
18 Website and in the Short-Form Notice and Long-Form Notice, the deadline for Settlement
19 Class members to submit objections was July 18, 2019. No objections were postmarked or
20 received before this deadline.

21 However, one putative objection was postmarked July 25, 2019 and received by Class
22 Counsel on August 6, 2019. *See* Exhibit A. This putative objection was submitted by an inmate
23 at a prison in Pennsylvania who "invokes a claim for monetary relief that he may otherwise
24 have against Niantic; and invokes any and all legal rights, substantive due process." *Id.* It
25 provides the inmate's mailing address at the prison but does not list any other address or
26 otherwise contain any information indicating membership in the Settlement Class. Because the
27 putative objection contains no information indicating membership in the Settlement Class, and
28 the Settlement has no effect on monetary claims, the putative objection should be overruled.

1 As of August 6, 2019, no other putative objections have been received. This favorable
2 reaction by the Settlement Class further supports the fairness and adequacy of the Settlement.
3 *See Omnivision*, 559 F. Supp. 2d at 1043; *Nat'l Rural Telecomms.*, 221 F.R.D. at 529 (“[T]he
4 absence of a large number of objections to a proposed class action settlement raises a strong
5 presumption that the terms of a proposed class settlement action are favorable to the class
6 members.”).

7 **Conclusion**

8 For all the foregoing reasons, the Settlement should be granted final approval; the
9 Settlement Class should be certified for settlement purposes; the Named Plaintiffs (Scott
10 Dodich and Jayme Gotts-Dodich; The Villas of Positano Condominium Association, Inc.; Jill
11 M. Barbarise; Jason Sarkis; Melissa Perez; Congshan “Sam” Hao; Bruce Garton; Sally Rogers;
12 Deborah J. Pimentel; and Loren Morgan) should be appointed as class representatives; and
13 Pomerantz LLP should be appointed Class Counsel. In addition, Plaintiffs respectfully request
14 that this Court grant an award of \$4 million as attorneys’ fees and as reimbursement for
15 expenses that Plaintiffs’ Counsel advanced for the benefit of the Settlement Class that were
16 reasonably necessary to the prosecution of this Action, and were the type usually billed to
17 clients outside of a contingency payment arrangement. Finally, Plaintiffs’ Counsel request that
18 the Named Plaintiffs be granted service awards of \$2,500 each for their efforts expended in this
19 Action, without which the Settlement would not have been achieved.

20
21 Dated: August 7, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

POMERANTZ LLP

/s/ Murielle J. Steven Walsh

Jeremy A. Lieberman

Murielle J. Steven Walsh

Aatif Iqbal

600 Third Avenue

20th Floor

New York, NY 10016

Phone: 212-661-1100

Fax: 917-463-1044

Email: jalieberman@pomlaw.com

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

mjsteven@pomlaw.com
aiqbal@pomlaw.com

POMERANTZ LLP

Patrick V. Dahlstrom
Ten South LaSalle Street, Suite 3505
Chicago, Illinois 60603
Phone: 312-377-1181
Fax: 312-229-8811
Email: pdahlstrom@pomlaw.com

POMERANTZ LLP

Jennifer Pafiti (SB # 282790)
1100 Glendon Avenue
Los Angeles, CA 90024
Phone: 310-405-7190
Email: jpafiti@pomlaw.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs

Exhibit A

~~Rowland~~ KQ 7780

508 Overlook Drive
LaBelle, PA 15450-0999

LEGAL DEPARTMENT

IS



U.S. POSTAGE PITNEY BOWES



ZIP 15450 \$ 000.50⁰
02 4W
0000354482 JUL 25 2019

ep class action clerk

TO Class Counsel:

- Pommeroy, CA 600 Third Avenue

20th Floor

New York, New York

~~XXXX~~

INMATE MAIL - DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS

Ref: 846092 pg 7 of 14 for RONALD DANDAR

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED
Ronald Dandar

RONALD DANDAR KQ7780
LEGAL MAIL DEPARTMENT
50 OUSLOOK Drive
LA Belle, Penna 15450
Please return a copy - OF what I AM SENDING

TO CLASS COUNSEL:

6-1-2019

- ① PLEASE SEND A COPY OF ALL PLEADINGS
FILINGS, COURT RECORDS, COURT LITIGATION, ANY AND ALL
TRANSCRIPTS SYNDICATED, DOCKET ENTRIES AND UP-TO
DATE PASS, PRESENT, PRIOR, COMMENCEMENT FILINGS.
- ② PLEASE ADD ME TO THE MASTER PROOF OF SERVICE
ALL-ANY MAILINGS - LITIGATION
"COURT RECORDS"

over

PLEASE SEND COPY OF WWW.POKEMON GO SETTLEMENT COM.
CLASS ACTION. PETITIONER: RON DANDAR

IN REGARD: POKEMON GO NUISANCE
LITIGATION, CASE NO 3:16-CV-04300 -
JD, CAL'S) - OBJECTION TO PROPOSED CLASS
ACTION SETTLEMENT: UNFAIR, EQUITABLE CLAIMS:

II. CLASS ACTION - COUNSEL: POMER
ANTZ, LLP, 600 THIRD AVENUE, 20TH
FLOOR NEW YORK, N.Y. 10016 -

III. PETITIONERS, OBJECTION TO THE SETTLE-
MENT AGREEMENT; OBJECTION TO FINAL
APPROVAL HEARING, ON AUGUST 22 2019 -

IV. PETITIONER, INVOKES A CLAIM FOR MONEY
TAX RELIEF, THAT HE MAY OTHERWISE HAVE
AGAINST NIANTIC; AND INVOKES, ANT AND
ALL LEGAL RIGHTS, SUBSTANTIVE DUE PROCESS

V. PETITIONER REQUEST FOR THE BELOW:

A) ALL VIOLATIONS OF STATE TRESPASS AND
NUISANCE LAWS. THE SETTLEMENT AND THE
INJUNCTIVE RELIEF IT PROVIDES; THE PROCED-
URES FOR OBJECTIONS TO THE SETTLEMENT INTER ALIA

II. REQUEST TO BE PUT ON THE MASTER PROOF
OF SERVICE. AN UP-TO-DATE DOCKET ENTRIES,
AND UP TO DATE, ANT AND ALL FILINGS, EXHIBITS,
COURT RECORDS, COURT LITIGATION AS A CLASS MEM-
BER "THE COMPLAINTS" RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED

PLEASE SEND A DETAILED NOTICE. Ron Dandar
RON DANDAR, K07780 LEGAL DEPT 50 OVERTON DR
MAYFIELD, PENNA 15450
MAILINGS 6-1-2019

[The page contains extremely faint, illegible handwriting on lined paper. The text is mirrored across the lines, suggesting bleed-through from the reverse side of the page. No specific words or phrases are discernible.]